Reviewer’s report

Title: Preoperative workup in the assessment of adrenal incidentalomas. Outcome from 282 consecutive laparoscopic adrenalectomies.

Version: 4 Date: 28 October 2013

Reviewer: Michael Brauckhoff

Reviewer’s report:

The paper is in several parts revised. The authors answered on all comments and questions. However, my major concerns did not sufficiently be addressed. Moreover, the authors’ answer on comment (9) illustrates the real dilemma of the paper: obviously the authors compare two different time periods which changes the intention of the study completely. In that case we are not any longer talking about following guidelines but “learning curve” which, by the way, would also explain the different conversion rates in otherwise relatively similar groups regarding the diameter of the lesions. Anyhow, it is scientifically inappropriate to assess the effect of a “method” (in this case the guidelines) with results from a period when these “methods” were not yet available.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.