Reviewer's report

Title: Treatment modality in type II odontoid fractures defines the outcome in elderly patients

Version: 2 Date: 26 July 2013

Reviewer: Akhil Verheyden

Reviewer's report:

1. The study is retrospective and is likely that the conservative treated patients have had higher morbidity. That is underlined by the fact, that so many have died short time after conservative treatment.
2. The rate of non union in anterior screw fixation is unacceptable high compared to literature and my own experience.
3. It is not pointed out if the bony fusion in the posterior treated group has happen at the odontoid or only at the posterior structures.
4. Because there was no randomisation it is not appropriate to compare the 3 different groups.
5. To perform a proper study there has to be a protocol with randomisation and defined follow ups with CT scans for all to be able to judge the bony fusion

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Not suitable for publication unless extensively edited

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests

Akhil Verheyden