Reviewer's report

Title: Accept or refuse? Factors influencing the decision-making of transplant surgeons who are offered a pancreas: results of a qualitative study

Version: 1 Date: 30 March 2013

Reviewer: Manuel Maglione

Reviewer's report:

The authors wrote a very interesting paper which resembles very well the current situation in pancreas transplantation. Missing evidence in pancreas transplantation makes it difficult to establish a standard operating procedure when accepting a pancreas.

All the following comments are minor essential revisions:
- The lack of evidence should be mentioned clearly in the discussion, evtlly referring to the recent review Curr Opin Organ Transplant. 2013 Feb;18(1):83-8.
- I am missing in the discussion the Pancreas DRI, which is an interesting tool for evaluating the quality of an offered pancreas (American Journal of Transplantation. 2010;10(4):837-845). Is it well accepted in Germany?
- In general I am missing in the discussion the analyses of the problems encountered by surgeons, e.g. prognosed ischemia time, DCDs (Am J Transplant. 2012 Aug;12(8):2150-6). Analysing the answers of the interviewees is surely important, but it is probably not enough for a good "take home message" in a surgical journal.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests