Reviewer's report

**Title:** The Belsey Mark IV: An operation with an enduring role in the management of complicated hiatal hernia.

**Version:** 2  **Date:** 17 December 2012

**Reviewer:** Clemens Gerstenkorn, Dr. med.

**Reviewer's report:**

manuscript worse while publishing
there should be more detail provided about PH manometrie and why not all patients received preoperative and postoperative 24 hour ph monitoring
there are 3 failures, one should describe in more detail why and what was done as a result

it is important that the Belsey Mark IV operation is not forgotten and that it still has its place in surgical treatment of selected hiatus herniae. Especially in circumstances were minimal invasive abdominal procedures are not reasonable or possible - one should analyse the failures of the open thoracic approach more carefully and explain / debate how they can be avoided

success rates should be above 85 %