Reviewer's report

Title: Ultrasonic scalpel causes greater depth of soft tissue necrosis compared to monopolar electrocautery in a pig model

Version: 3 Date: 4 January 2012

Reviewer: Daniel Rittirsch

Reviewer's report:

Minor Essential Revisions

Unfortunately, data comparing both devices at different power level settings are not available. The authors addressed this concern by pointing out that they have focused on standard power level settings used in abdominal surgery, which limits the informative value of the study. I suggest to revise the title of the manuscript (e.g. by adding 'at standard power level settings') since the current title may be misleading and is not necessarily supported by the data presented. Moreover, it should be also explicitly mentioned in the Material & Method section (page 4, 2nd paragraph) that the power levels used in the present study represent standard settings in abdominal surgery.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.