Reviewer's report

**Title:** Long term outcome and quality of life after open incisional hernia repair - light versus heavy weight meshes

**Version:** 1  **Date:** 6 June 2011

**Reviewer:** Pankaj Garg

**Reviewer's report:**

Major Compulsory Revisions

1. Please explain the vast difference between the mean hernia size between the two groups. The mean hernia size in LW group is almost double of HW group and yet the p value is 0.29. Please recheck the p value. This is important as all the benefits in LW group could possibly be neutralized due to the large hernia size in that group.

2. Why was Pain not evaluated as one of the parameter? In such a study, pain scoring is an important point. Please explain.

3. The small sample size is definitely a major shortcoming.

**Level of interest:** An article of importance in its field

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Statistical review:** Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

'I declare that I have no competing interests