Reviewer's report

**Title:** The impact of open versus closed format ICU admission practices on the outcome of high risk surgical patients: a cohort analysis

**Version:** 4  **Date:** 19 July 2011

**Reviewer:** Judith Jacobi

**Reviewer's report:**

Thank you to the authors for addressing my concerns. Congratulations on a well done paper.

Minor suggestions (discretionary) strengthen table descriptions
Table 1. Potential complications recorded at hospital discharge
Table 2. The Identification of Risk in Surgical Patients (IRIS) Score elements
Table 4. Patient outcome results
Table 5. Length of stay results

**Level of interest:** An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests