Reviewer's report

Title: Impact of Age on Outcome after Colorectal Cancer Surgery in the Elderly - a developing country perspective

Version: 1 Date: 19 May 2011

Reviewer: Walter Brunner

Reviewer's report:

Even if several publications already show that increasing age itself is not independently associated with a higher complication rate in colorectal surgery this is a good retrospective review looking on this topic in a single center in a developing country. Nevertheless, there is a chance on more information out of this review.

Major Compulsory Revisions

The number of surgeons and if there is any difference in experience of the surgeons of those two groups in colorectal surgery should not remain unknown to exclude the bias of more experienced surgeons in operations of the elderly patients.

The preoperative complications in both groups are over 80%. Not mentioned are the kind of complications beside bowel obstruction with 18 % resp. 12% and Table 2 "Perforation".

Since anastomotic leakage and abdominal sepsis are the most severe postoperative complications often requiring reoperation or intervention this should be mentioned detailed for both groups and divided in colon and rectum. The need for reoperation or intervention after surgery is not mentioned yet.

Minor Essential Revisions

In the discussion a secondary exercise with different cut offs of age at 60, 65 and 75 years is mentioned whereas only two further cut offs of 60 and 65 years are noted in the methods and the results.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests