Reviewer's report

**Title:** Emergency open cholecystectomy is associated with markedly lower risk of postoperative nausea and vomiting (PONV) than elective open cholecystectomy: a retrospective cohort study.

**Version:** 3  **Date:** 10 October 2009

**Reviewer:** Paul Karanicolas

**Reviewer's report:**

The authors should be commended for addressing all of the reviewers' comments and revising their manuscript substantially. Having said that, the fact remains that the design of the study is very limited in that it is a retrospective cohort study, relying on clinical records. Irrespective of the authors' arguments that the strength of the association is so large that it must be true, the internal validity remains low. Furthermore, the practice of these surgeons (open cholecystectomies for all urgent cases and many elective cases, NG tubes for many patients, etc), is very different than the standard of care in North America and limits the applicability of these findings. Finally, even if one believes the results of this study, it unfortunately has little clinical implication.

If this study is published, I would suggest the following specific changes:

1) Change the term "risk" in the title to "rate" or "incidence"
2) The conclusion section of the abstract remains too long- the justification for the conclusion is not needed here, but the conclusion does need to be justified!
3) There remain several spelling and grammatical errors that should be corrected.

**Level of interest:** An article of limited interest

**Quality of written English:** Needs some language corrections before being published

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

'I declare that I have no competing interests'