Reviewer’s report

Title: Superficial saphenofemoral arteriovenous fistula as hemodialysis access: clinical experience

Version: 2 Date: 2 May 2010

Reviewer: Tushar Vachharajani

Reviewer’s report:

The authors need to be commended for reporting their experience of creating a lower extremity arterio-venous fistula in this difficult ESRD population. The topic is very relevant and the experience is very valuable for the literature.

I would suggest several major revisions to the authors:

1. The number of SSFAVF cases in the abstract are reported as 51 in 45 patients and in the methods as 56 in 48 patients. The authors need to be consistent with their results and confirm the remainder of the findings are appropriately reported.

2. The definition of kT/V for hemodialysis is generally not weekly but for each session unlike defined as weekly in the manuscript

3. The youngest patient is 10 years old. Why was a SSFAVF created in a 10 year old patient?

4. The references listed are not relevant to the manuscript. These need to be appropriately modified. The reference number 2-10 needs to be changed

5. The SD needs to be reported in a standard fashion as +/- value rather than %

6. The Kaplan Meier results need to be reported as a figure rather than a table

Minor:

The use of certain terms is incorrect. "Confection" is not the appropriate english term for creation of an AVF. Editorial support for english language and grammar would make it easy for publication.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Not suitable for publication unless extensively edited

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.