Reviewer’s report

Title: Predicting Survival after Pulmonary Metastasectomy for Colorectal Cancer: Previous Liver Metastases Matter

Version: 1 Date: 3 April 2010

Reviewer: Oliver Thomusch

Reviewer’s report:

Landes et al. presented a retrospective study of 40 consecutive patients who underwent resection of pulmonary metastases from CRC from 1996 to 2009. Median follow-up was 33 months (range 4-139 months). Median disease-free interval between primary colorectal tumor and development of lung metastases was 32.5 months. In their highly selected patient cohort 3- and 5-year overall survival after thoracotomy was 70.1% and 43.4%, respectively. They clearly elaborated in their analysis by multivariate analysis that tumor recurrence after thoracotomy is associated by a history of previous liver metastasis and lung surgery other than wedge resection. Keeping these prognostic parameter in mind they found in their patient cohort a median survival after thoracotomy of 87 (range 34-139) months in the group of patients without liver metastases versus 40 (range 28-51) months in patients who had undergone any kind of prior hepatic surgery.

The authors clearly showed, that patients with metastases of CRC are possible candidates for surgery with a curative intent. Good patient selection is mandatory for treatment success and hepatic metastases are likely to be a risk factor for tumor recurrence.

The presented manuscript needs no further working up and should be published in BMC Surgery

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests