Reviewer's report

Title: Benign Ancient Schwannoma of the abdominal wall: An unwanted birthday present.

Version: 1 Date: 27 August 2009

Reviewer: Daniel Candinas

Reviewer's report:

This is a well written case report describing a patient with a benign, large schwannoma of the abdominal wall that was coincidentally diagnosed by a Life Scan, the latter being a novel trend or spleen in first world medicine proposing sometimes unsolicited diagnosis.

The histological findings, diagnostic methods and therapy are described in detail and some valid thoughts on the consequences of Life Scans are briefly discussed.

Major remarks:
- Relevance of the description of a very rare benign disease; yet it exists, so why not communicate.
- Although diagnostic procedures including CT Scan, MRI, FNAC and FNAB are described in detail, the authors conclude, that excision is best for diagnosis; so why bother if you take it out anyway?
- The histological and immunohistochemistry-findings are too extensively discussed for a case report; some shortening might be an issue
- Positive: The economical consequences and burden to public healthcare delivery and funding of Life Scans. This aspect could be discussed more detailed, e.g. costs, morbidity of further interventional procedures, ethical aspects, the trembling uncertainty of the patient, etc. Furthermore this could be the keypoint of the whole case report instead of the description of a very rare benign disease as main topic
- Positive. Comprehensive literature index

Minor remarks
- Typing errors should be corrected
- Figures: Macroscopic figures can be omitted, the CT scan is very instructive as well as the microscopic pictures

Recommendation: Accept after moderate corrections