Reviewer’s report

Title: Choline-stabilized orthosilicic acid supplementation as an adjunct to Calcium/Vitamin D3 stimulates markers of bone formation in osteopenic females: a randomized, placebo-controlled trial.

Version: 1 Date: 14 January 2008

Reviewer: Willem F Lems

Reviewer’s report:

Review artikel TD Spector: choline stabilized orthosilic acid supplementation etc

Overall:
Double-blind, placebo controlled study. Clear study design.
Provides the reader with additional information.
Generally well written.
Interesting to see further investigations with sufficient power and with fracture data.

Major issues:
Ã¢â‚¬Â· The major limitation is of course that fracture data are lacking, as mentioned by the authors, and that the effects on BMD and bone markers are absent or only modest.
Ã¢â‚¬Â· (bone markers and BMD are both surrogate outcome markers)
Ã¢â‚¬Â· The key question is, whether ch-OSA is not very effective, or is there a lack of power?
Ã¢â‚¬Â· Is silica the effective compound, or choline?
Ã¢â‚¬Â· Why is there an effect on P1NP, and not on other markers of bone formation? (osteocalcin, BAP)

Minor issues:
Ã¢â‚¬Â· Abstract:
  o Conclusion: why the comment â##safeâ##? This is not mentioned in the results.
  o
  
  
Ã¢â‚¬Â· Discussion:
  o High urinary magnesium/creatinine ratio due to low muscle mass in osteopenic women: please insert a reference.
  o They relatively high dropout rate is not related to the medication itself.? (Some (n?) decided not to take further part is the study.)
Conclusion:
- Please remove reference 31 out of the conclusion

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
'I declare that I have no competing interests'