Reviewer's report

Title: Charnley low-friction arthroplasty of the hip. Five to 25 years survivorship in a general hospital.

Version: 3 Date: 25 March 2008

Reviewer: robert bourne

Reviewer's report:

I thank the authors for responding to my constructive suggestions. The manuscript is significantly improved. I do have some constructive suggestions once again.

Abstract, pg. 2, Results: I believe that the percentage for the two neurological injuries is incorrect. The authors state 2% when I believe this should be 1%.

Page 4, par. 2, line 2: Did the two independent investigators (ASV, JFL) categorize the radiographs into those that were possibly, probably or definitely loose using the criteria of Harris et al? If so, this might be useful information to include.

Page 7, par. 1: The authors might want to suggest that a national joint replacement registry would be a useful tool to compare outcomes for high volume and low volume community hospitals as well as academic centres.

Overall Assessment: I think that this paper is substantially improved and would recommend consideration for publication.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.