Reviewer's report

Title: "Hydrodilation, corticosteroids and adhesive capsulitis: A randomized controlled trial

Version: 3 Date: 27 November 2007

Reviewer: Joy C Macdermid

Reviewer's report:

Major Issues

1. Excellent study overall. RCT with attention to important design issues.
2. Selection criteria to get into the study may have excluded acute frozen shoulder; please recognize this and potential impact on prognosis
3. Since you used minimization on SPADI, important to show how the distribution of these between allocations

Minor Issues

1. I think the sample size of 44 estimated was appropriate. You can rationalize why you did not need to meet that but should have a reference that regression would lessen sample size requirements. You should also consider the sample size required for regression. You should also discuss that your actual SDs were higher than estimated. In consideration of all of these facts I am not convinced that the study was fully powered. Given this it is important that you considered that your range of difference (up to 11 points on SPADI) is potentially clinically significant and make sure your conclusions reflect this.

2. I think it is important to point out (as you did) that this RX may be an adjunct to physical therapy and thus a larger RCT with PT as standard Rx is required to fully understand the usefulness of this intervention. The current trials suggest is has no or marginal effects alone.

What next?: Accept after discretionary revisions

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.