Reviewer's report

Title: Natural Course of Intra-Articular Shifting Bone Marrow Edema Syndrome of the Knee

Version: 1 Date: 28 November 2007

Reviewer: Christian Ernst Berger

Reviewer's report:

General
The current report describes a small series of patients suffering from migrating BMES of the knee. Interestingly, the authors observed a vertical shift of BMES migration from lateral tibial and vice versa in 2 patients. MRI pattern and clinical symptoms resolved in all patients after conservative and operative treatment. Progression to ON was not seen in any patient underlying the selflimited course of the disease.

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

Pages need to be numbered
page 4, para 3, line 4: please provide data regarding mild varus deformity in two patients (long standing x-rays, hip/ankle angle?)
page 6, line 6: 2 patients exhibited a vertical shift of BMES, was there any deformity present in these patients?
page 6, para 1 last line: the statement referring to one patient undergoing core decompression is unclear
page 9, para 3, line 8: the term progression to ON would be more appropriate
page 10, para 3, line 4: the deduction that conservative treatment is superior to operative treatment in BMES cases can not be made from a single observation

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field
Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.