Reviewer’s report

Title: Knee complaints seen in general practice: athletes versus non-athletes

Version: 1 Date: 5 December 2007

Reviewer: Olivier Bruyere

Reviewer’s report:

The objective of this study was to investigate the differences in type of knee complaints, medical consumption and outcomes between athletes and non-athletes.

This is a well-designed, interesting study.

Major Compulsory Revisions

- Abstract: I believe that the most interesting results of this study are not highlighted. As a matter of fact, the authors focus mainly on the significant results. However, from my point of view, the fact that there are no significant differences of “active strategy”, “medication” or “referrals to caregivers” between the two groups is also very important and interesting. The same remark is also true for “functional disability” or the medical consumption at one year. I would suggest to reduce the part of the “conclusion” section and to add more results.

- Abstract: the fact that occasional athletes were excluded from this study must be added.

- Discussion: I am surprised that there are no other studies having compared knee complaints (or symptoms) between athletes and non-athletes. It could be interesting to compare the results obtained by the authors to results obtained in other studies.

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests