Reviewer's report

Title: Post-traumatic glenohumeral cartilage lesions: a systematic review

Version: 3 Date: 24 April 2008

Reviewer: NOBUYUKI YAMAMOTO

Reviewer's report:

Major Compulsory Revisions:
The sentence, "Post-traumatic glenohumeral cartilage lesions are rare." may lead to a misunderstanding to readers. In this report, from the results, what the author could say is only the fact that there are few reports describing cartilage injury without any bony lesions in the literature. The authors cannot declare that post-traumatic cartilage lesion are rare. Conclusions should be reworded.

Post-traumatic glenohumeral cartilage lesions are often present with bony lesions in patients with traumatic anterior instability. Cartilage lesions are involved with osteochondral lesions in many cases. But as the author described, cartilage lesions without any bony lesions may occur. If a patient suffers a light external injury, such sort of situation may occur. In that case, the symptom of that patient is not severe and may not visit hospital for care. Thus, the author may be able to say that there have been few reports describing cartilage injury without any bony lesions in the literature. But the author should not conclude that post-traumatic cartilage lesion are rare. The author should describe some comments about this in the Discussions.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.