Reviewer’s report

Title: Anteroposterior glide versus rotating platform low contact stress (LCS) knee arthroplasty: a randomised controlled trial

Version: 4 Date: 6 August 2007

Reviewer: Ching-Chuan Jiang

Reviewer’s report:

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

No matter how knee ROM is measured, it will be fine, as long as the evaluator is blinded and the measuring method is standardized.

From statistical point of view, to detect a difference of 20# in the condition with a SD of 20#(effect size=1), very small size is sufficient. With the possibility of such a big difference, it’s hard to tell these two groups were similar. Consultation of the statistician is recommended.

ITT means including all randomized patients in the groups to which they were randomly assigned, regardless of their adherence with the entry criteria, regardless of the treatment they actually received, and regardless of subsequent withdrawal from treatment or deviation from the protocol. The author should address this in more detail, like last-observation-carried-forward or multiple imputations. Consultation of the statistician is recommended.

What next?: Accept after discretionary revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.