Reviewer's report

Title: Beta-synemin expression in cardiotoxin-injected rat skeletal muscle

Version: 2 Date: 8 March 2007

Reviewer: Zhenlin Li

Reviewer's report:

General
The manuscript described the expression of one synemin isoform, beta-synemin, and alpha-dystrobrevin-1 and -2 in the developing and regenerating rat skeletal muscle by Western blot analysis, coimmunoprecipitation and immunohistology methods. The authors provide the new data concerning: (1) the expression of beta-synemin and alpha-dystrobrevin-2 in the regeneration rat skeletal muscles, (2) the absence of beta-synemin staining in the type 2A fibers, (3) the beta-synemin preferentially co-immunoprecipitated with alpha-dystrobrevin-1, and similar expression of these two proteins in both the regenerating and developing rat muscles. The question posed by the authors is new and well defined. The results are presented correctly and the discussion is concordant with the results presented. I recommend the publication after the minor essential revisions.

------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)
(1) It is confusing to set the relative protein levels in days 1 and 28 at 0% and 100%. In addition, it is not applicable to alpha-dystrobrevin-2. If you put the relative protein level of alpha-dystrobrevin-2 on day 1 as 0%, the pattern of this protein is similar to that of beta-synemin except the days 28. It is more logical to set only the relative protein level on days 28 at 100%.
(2) There is mistakes in the reference citation. Reference of Xue et al is omitted. « it is suggestive that beta-synemin is also associated with signaling (24) » should be (23). Xue et al should be 24, the present reference 24 ans 25 should be 25 and 26.
(3) Figure 4 seems have a extra picture in the alpha-dystrobrevin-1wertern blot.

------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests