Author’s response to reviews

Title: Oxidative stress as a risk factor for osteoporosis in elderly Mexican as characterized by antioxidant enzymes

Authors:

Martha A Sanchez-Rodriguez (masanrod@yahoo.com.mx)
Mirna Ruiz-Ramos (mirna1411@yahoo.com.mx)
Elsa Correa-Munoz (elcomm@terra.com.mx)
Victor Manuel Mendoza-Nunez (mendovic@servidor.unam.mx)

Version: 3 Date: 13 December 2007

Author's response to reviews: see over
December 12, 2007

MELISSA NORTON, MD
EDITOR-IN-CHIEF
BMC-Musculoskeletal Disorders

Dear Melissa Norton, MD:

I send you the corrected manuscript [R2] entitled “Oxidative stress as a risk factor for osteoporosis in elderly Mexican as characterized by antioxidant enzymes”, according to the comments of the reviewers, to be reviewed and possibly published in BMC-Musculoskeletal Disorders.

Sincerely

Víctor Manuel Mendoza-Núñez, MD, PhD (Corresponding author)
FES Zaragoza, UNAM
Batalla 5 de mayo s/n
Esq. Fuerte de Loreto
Col. Ejército de Oriente
Mexico City 09230
México
E-mail: mendovic@servidor.unam.mx
ANSWER TO COMMENTS OF REVIEWERS POINT BY PONT

MS: 8439889681511178

**Oxidative stress as a risk factor for osteoporosis in elderly Mexican as characterized by antioxidant enzymes**

Martha A Sanchez-Rodriguez, Mirna Ruiz-Ramos, Elsa Correa-Munoz and Victor Manuel Mendoza-Nunez

**Reviewer:** Tuan V Nguyen

**Comment:**
1. “Tables 3 and 4 essentially convey the same information. It should be combined into a single table”.

**Answer:**
We consider that is necessary include both tables, because are complementary.

**Comment:**
2. “Please note that in the logistic regression model, one can not compute the R-square statistic; however, one may compute the so-called pseudo R-square. The authors need to explain more clearly how did they calculate this statistic (preferably with a reference).”

**Answer:**
This was included in the paragraph of statistical analysis.

**Comment:**
3. “As I mentioned in the initial review, I found the rationale for categorizing the stress score rather unconvinced. The statement “A stress score ranging from 1 to 6 was used, representing the severity of biomarkers modification; a score 1 was given to each value higher or lower than the cut off” is not clear. I don’t understand it. Which cut-off value?”

**Answer:**
The cut-off for oxidative stress was >3, according with our construct (*Bioquimia* 2004, 29: 81-90; *Free Radic Biol Med* 2006, 41: S29). This was clarified in the manuscript.

**Comment:**
4. “Some numbers in the manuscript are not consistent. For example, in page 11 the authors report an OR associated with age >70 of 4.45 but in Table 5 it is 3.45. Moreover, the OR associated with overweight (BMI>27) in page 11 is 0.39, but in Table 5 it is 0.36.”
Comment:
5. “Why overweight was defined as BMI>27? While I understand that this could be an ethnic-specific cut-off value, I think the authors should provide a better rationale or reference to support their chosen cut-off value.”

Answer:
It is considered as overweight in elderly when the cut-off point of BMI is ≥ 27 (Reuben et al. J Am Geriatr Soc 1995, 43:415-425). This was clarified in the manuscript.

Comment:
6. “In Table 5, a risk factor called “Smoke”. The authors should explicitly state whether this is “Cigarette smoking”, past or present. “Alcohol ingestion” presumably means “Alcohol intake”.

Answer:
This was corrected.