Author's response to reviews

Title: Does Alendronate Reduce the Risk of Fracture in Men? A Meta-analysis Incorporating Prior Knowledge of Anti-Fracture Efficacy in Women

Authors:

Anna M Sawka MD (sawkaam@yahoo.com)
Alexandra Papaioannou MD (jd.adachi@sympatico.ca)
Jonathan D Adachi MD (jd.adachi@sympatico.ca)
Amiram Gafni PhD (sawkaam@yahoo.com)
David A Hanley MD (jd.adachi@sympatico.ca)
Lehana Thabane PhD (sawkaam@yahoo.com)

Version: 3 Date: 27 April 2005

Author's response to reviews: see over
To the Editor of BioMed Central Musculoskeletal Disorders,

We would like to thank the editor and the statistical reviewer, Dr. Huson, for reviewing our revised manuscript, titled, “Does Alendronate Reduce the Risk of Fracture in Men? A Meta-analysis Incorporating Prior Knowledge of Anti-Fracture Efficacy in Women” (MS 1079418594774445). Dr. Huson implied that we had responded to his review in a prior submission, however, the only reviews that we previously received for this manuscript were from Drs. Heaney and Cranney. Thus, this is our first opportunity to address the issues raised by Dr. Huson. We are happy to see that Dr. Huson is accepting of the statistical approach employed in the manuscript and has not critiqued the methodology that we used. Dr. Huson has indicated that more information on Bayesian methodology and a justification for the Bayesian approach is not needed. It is important to note that in reviewing a prior version of this manuscript, the clinicians, Drs. Heaney and Cranney, had specifically requested a justification for the Bayesian approach and more information on Bayesian methodology, respectively. We had therefore followed this advice, and included this information in the most recently submitted version of the manuscript. Although statisticians may be very familiar with Bayesian methodology, clinicians may not be as familiar with this field. Given that clinicians may be in the majority of readers of papers published in BioMed Central Musculoskeletal Disorders, we prefer to follow the advice of the other reviewers, and provide the supplemental information on Bayesian methodology and the justification for its approach. We realize that this information may be considered superfluous to knowledgeable statisticians reading the paper, but we suspect that group is not the primary target audience of the journal. Thus, we have not removed any of the concepts in question from the manuscript. As Dr. Huson has not suggested any major compulsory, minor essential, or discretionary revisions, the manuscript has not been changed. If you have any questions or concerns, please contact Dr. Adachi or A. Sawka

Sincerely,

A.M. Sawka, MD and J.D. Adachi, MD