Reviewer's report

**Title:** Immunologic Testing of Xeno-Derived Osteochondral Grafts Using Peripheral Blood Mononuclear Cells from Healthy Human Donors

**Version:** 1  **Date:** 16 February 2005

**Reviewer:** Gilles Benichou

**Reviewer's report:**

This is an interesting paper addressing the immune response to xeno osteochondral transplants. The study measures the production of various cytokines by human monocytes exposed to osteochondral transplants from various species. The work has been well designed and conducted and the results are clear. In addition, the paper is well written. Apparently, all the transplants but the ovine ones are xenoimmunogenic in that they trigger significant cytokine releases. In addition, the processing step seems to reduce or abrogate this effect.

Minor comments:

1) The authors should comment on the purity of monocyte preparations.
2) Are purified monocytes used in each assay?
3) The authors should elaborate on the possible effect of photoxidation of the innate immunity in this model. The role of reactive oxygen species may be evoked.

**What next?:** Accept after discretionary revisions

**Level of interest:** An article of outstanding merit and interest in its field

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Statistical review:** No

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I have no competing interest