Reviewer's report

Title: Bone mineral density, body mass index and cigarette smoking among Iranian women: Implications for prevention

Version: 3 Date: 19 April 2005

Reviewer: Lars Rejnmark

Reviewer's report:

General

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

The authors have not appropriately addressed the major concern mentioned in comment 1. Postmenopausal women are aged app. 45 to +95 years. Within this age range, BMD varies considerably. If the population studied had been very old postmenopausal women, it is most likely that the study had shown a low BMD, whereas a relatively high BMD had been found if the studied population was around 50 years of age. Thus, as studied subjects were not sampled in an age-stratified manner, the average T-score found in the present study is the result of the age in the studied subjects. This should be mentioned as a limitation to study.

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests