Reviewer's report

Title: Nodular osteochondrogenic activity in soft tissue surrounding osteoma in Neurologic Para Osteo-Arthropathy: Morphological and immunohistochemical study.

Version: 1 Date: 29 March 2004
Reviewer: Kenichi Matsuzaka

Reviewer's report:

This paper describes about a mechanism of NPOA leading to cartilage and bone formation morphologically and immunohistochemically. So this is acceptable for BMC Musculoskeletal Disorders, but authors should change the contents following the comments below.

- Major Compulsory Revisions
  1. Although authors describe in conclusion that the results are in agreement with muscular origin of NPOA and support specially this hypothesis, there are no evidence in the results. So authors must indicate the reasons for agreement with muscular origin of NPOA, and must add to stain by the other antibodies of desmin etc.

  2. 28 samples were used in this paper, so authors should indicate the sample source, ie. gender, age, region and etc. in table. Further, statistical analysis about sample source is requested, because this paper is not a case report but a regular paper.

  3. The statistical analysis and its discussion about the results of histological and immunohistological staining are also requested.

- Minor Essential Revisions
  1. Figure 3, 7, is not clear, so authors should change other picture or remove it.

  2. Figure 5c: I cannot observe the positive area for Osteocalcin immunolabelling in this picture. So Authors should change the picture or should change the results.

  3. Figure 5d: There is no necessary to use this picture, and only the picture in inset is needed.

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests: