Reviewer's report

Title: Type-selective muscular degeneration promotes infiltrative growth of intramuscular lipoma

Version: 1 Date: 5 March 2004

Reviewer: Bruce Smoller

Reviewer's report:

General
this is an interesting little study that opens up a large area for discussion.

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

How specific is the staining pattern of these antibodies? It would be good to demonstrate the staining pattern in normal, uninvolved muscle far from lipoma.

Were there differences in the staining patterns between the well circumscribed lesions and the infiltrative ones? I found it difficult to sort out this question, specifically, though it is alluded to in several areas.

While the authors make a good preliminary point, are they quite convinced that they can entirely rule out the possibility that the selective degenerative changes are not caused by the primary growth of the adipocytes (i.e., some fibers more susceptible to degradation than others) rather than their hypothesis that the lipoma is a secondary process? Do the authors feel that the well-circumscribed lesions have a similar pathogenesis or might they be true primary tumors?

What next?: Accept after discretionary revisions

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

None