Reviewer's report

Title: Type-selective muscular degeneration promotes infiltrative growth of intramuscular lipoma

Version: Date: 5 February 2004

Reviewer: masanori Ban

Reviewer's report:

General
This manuscript is not logical. Why do the authors consider that muscular degeneration precedes the infiltrative growth of lipoma cells? Can they distinguish between infiltrating lipomas and replacement lipomatosis? The proliferation of adipose cells can be seen in many kinds of tumors. In those cases, pluripotential cells are thought to be triggered. I do not agree with their conclusion.

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)
1) This manuscript is too long.
2) There are many published cases of infiltrating lipomas with muscular atrophy. However, it is probable that nobody has referred to the difference of atrophy between fast and slow muscles. Only this point is interesting in this manuscript.

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)
1) Fig.1 & 3 do not show the features of infiltrating lipomas.

What next?: Reject because scientifically unsound

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Not suitable for publication unless extensively edited

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:
None