Reviewer's report

Title: Ligamentous rupture of the ACL associated with dislocated fracture of the proximal tibial physis in a 12-year-old boy

Authors:

Stefan Scholz (stefan.scholz@mcmail.vanderbilt.edu)
Lucas M. Wessel (lucas.wessel@med.uni-heidelberg.de)

Version: 1 Date: 23 Sep 2001

Reviewer: Dr N Yoshino

Level of interest: A paper whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Advice on publication: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until I see revised version

Generally, the presented case was very rare, and the paper is worthwhile.

#1. The blood examinations, including hormonal study, should be described, because the mechanical properties of the epiphyseal plate are influenced by some hormones, and the case was obese.
#2. The radiographs after reduction are required to prove accurate reduction. The last radiographs are also helpful for readers to show the leg alignment.
#3. I wonder why the 15mm leg-length discrepancy occurred. Generally, Salter-Harris type I and II epiphyseal fractures do not cause early growth arrest. The authors stated that the injured right leg was longer than the left leg. Therefore, I supposed that chondrodiatesis might happen by the injury. The radiographs just after the reduction and last ones are helpful to understand the event.

Discussion concerning the leg-length discrepancy is necessary.

Competing interests:

None declared.