Reviewer’s report

Title: Does surgery followed by physiotherapy improve short and long term outcome for patients with atraumatic shoulder instability compared with physiotherapy alone? Protocol for a randomized controlled clinical trial

Version: 6 Date: 22 October 2014

Reviewer: J. Michael Wiater, MD

Reviewer’s report:

The authors present a revised protocol for a multi-center prospective, randomized controlled trial evaluating the effectiveness of capsulolabral repair in patients with atraumatic shoulder instability. The protocol has been revised in response to previous review. Some previous issues have been clarified in the protocol, however, a few concerns still remain.

Major Compulsory Revisions

1. The previous review requested inclusion of “history of shoulder dislocation” as exclusion criteria. The current manuscript version indicates “high collision shoulder injury” without specifically stating “history of shoulder dislocation”. Please clarify this.

2. In the adverse events section “participation in this clinical trial will not entail additional risks beyond those associated with standard care options for atraumatic shoulder instability” is not further defined as previously requested. The risks of this study greater than use of MRI for evaluation should be stated.

3. Postoperative clinical assessment is not well defined. Please define in further detail how this assessment will be done and how complications will be monitored.

Discretionary Revisions

1. Please mention that you will record data on pathology variations by location, tear size, and type of repair (number of anchors, all-arthroscopic, types of suture fixation).

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests