Author's response to reviews

Title: Preoperative Planning of Calcium Deposit Removal in Calcifying Tendinitis of the Rotator Cuff - Possible Contribution of Computer Tomography, Ultrasound and Conventional X-Ray

Authors:

Kaywan Izadpanah (izadpanah@me.com)
Martin Jaeger (martin.jaeger@uniklink-freiburg.de)
Dirk Maier (dirk.maier@uniklink-freiburg.de)
Norbert P Südkamp (norbert.sudkamp@uniklink-freiburg.de)
Peter Ogon (peter@ogon.ws)

Version: 3 Date: 3 September 2014

Author's response to reviews: see over
Response to Reviewer comments:

Reviewer 1's Report:

Major Compulsory Revisions

**Surgical Procedure:**

- Did you ever use any imaging modalities during operation?
- If so, which one and in how many cases, or was the preop planning according to Ogon's sectors always sufficient

Response

- In the Result section the paragraph: “Removal of the calcium deposits was possible through the lateral approach that was planed on the base of the US in all patients.”
  - Into
  
  “Removal of the calcium deposits was possible through the lateral approach that was planed on the base of the Ogon sectors in all patients.”

- And

  “During the procedure no imaging modalities were used.” was added at the end of the paragraph.

**Results first paragraph:**

- The mean operation time... irrelevant for the paper

Response

- Sentence was deleted from the paragraph.

**Discussion first paragraph:**

- About 30%... and next two lines- relevant citations are Missing

Response

- Citations have been introduced

**Conclusion:**

Do you recommend to perform a CT scan in cases with deposits without sound shadow, or is it just helpful to know?

Response
We believe that determination of the morphology and the consistency of CDs is important for preoperative planning. This is especially true if the treatment modality might be needling.

Therefore we changed the conclusions from:

“US and CX are sufficient for preoperative planning of CD removal with regards to localization and prediction of consistency if the deposits present with full sound extinction. This is the case in the majority of the patients. However, in patients with missing sound extinction, only CT can reliably predict the consistency of the deposits. Satellite deposits or septations are regularly present, which is of importance if complete CD removal is aspired.”

“US and CX are sufficient for preoperative planning of CD removal with regards to localization and prediction of consistency if the deposits present with full sound extinction. This is the case in the majority of the patients. However, in patients with missing sound extinction, CT can be recommended if CDs consistency of the deposits should be determined. Satellite deposits or septations are regularly present, which is of importance if complete CD removal is aspired.”
Reviewer 2s Report:

This is my review on the article entitled „Preoperative Planning of Calcium Deposit Removal in Calcifying Tendinitis of the Rotator Cuff – Possible Contribution of Computer Tomography, Ultrasound and Conventional X-Ray“. The study presents interesting results regarding preoperative diagnostics in calcific tendinitis of the rotator cuff. The article is well written with a sound methodology. In my opinion it is suitable for publication as it presents interesting and important results.

However I have the following remarks:

Minor essential revisions:

Abstract:

-line 32: Please correct spelling mistakes

Response

- Corrected from Reliable to Reliable

line 43 + 44: The sentence „careful attention has to be given during CD removal to small satellite deposits or septations that can be found regularly“ cannot be concluded by your results. You did not correlate the presence of satellite deposits with clinical outcome and the necessity of complete calcium removal is controversially discussed.

Response

- As proposed below the sentence in the „Conclusions“ have been changed into: „Satellite deposits or septations are regularly present, which is of importance if complete CD removal is aspired."

Background:

- Please add blanks before citations throughout the text

Response

- Blanks have been introduced before all citations throughout the manuscript

Methods:

- line 97: Here you state „all patients“ and later on you write that some of the patients did not have outlet view radiographs. Please state in the Methods sections how many patients received all radiographs and you many received the X-ray in your institution.
Response

- As stated all patients received an true ap and outlet view. However, only about 52% received the images at our institution with an standardized outlet view. Only these patients were included into the subgroup analyzes of the localization to exclude the influence of projections for the investigation from other institutions.
- This was already stated in the Discussion:
  - “However, it has to be pointed out that only 52% of all patients had a standardized outlet view at the senior authors institution with standardized positioning. Only these patients were included in this subgroup analyzes in order to exclude the influence of projections for the investigation from other institutions.”
- In the method sections the sentence:
  - All patients underwent a conventional radiographic examination consisting of a “true ap view” in internal and external rotation (Figure1) and an outlet views. About 52% of the images were obtained in the seniors authors institution.” and
  - „Only patients imaged at our institution were included in this subgroup analyzes in order to exclude the influence of projections as images from other institutions were not taken with the same standard.” were added.

- line 106: Please change to computed tomography throughout the text

Response

Blanks have been introduced before all citations throughout the manuscript

Results:

- Headline has different style

Response

Fond was changed

Discussion:

Here you extensively discuss the importance of identifying satellite deposits and their removal respectively. You should also include in your discussion that there are plenty of studies showing that a (complete) removal of the deposits is not necessary [1-5].

Response

The following paragraph was added.

„ It has to be pointed out that the need of complete intraoperative removal of the CDs might not be necessary as several studies could show that either secondary resorption of the deposits develop or there exists no direct correlation between removal and clinical outcome (Gleyze:1997wv){Hofstee:2007cm}{Postel:1997uq}{Schiepers:2000vv}{Tillander:1998uz}.

However, the authors believe penetration of the CDs might propagate postoperative resorption of deposits.”
Conclusions:

I would recommend to change „Above this careful attention has to be drawn to satellite deposits or septations as they are present regularly and should be addressed to assure complete CD removal.“ To e.g. „It has to be noted that satellite deposits or septations are regularly present which is of importance if complete CD removal is aspired.“

Response

As proposed in the „Conclusions“ have been changed into: „Satellite deposits or septations are regularly present, which is of importance if complete CD removal is aspired.“