Reviewer’s report

Title: Lateral insertion is a good prognostic factor after in situ fixation in slipped capital femoral epiphysis

Version: 1 Date: 4 August 2014

Reviewer: Yasuharu Nakashima

Reviewer’s report:

1. The authors presented a study of the incidence of slip progression after in situ pinning and its prognostic factors. More than 5 degrees of further slip was observed in 14 hips (24%). Multivariate analysis showed that the screw insertion medial to intertrochanteric line was a significant factor for the slip progression. The manuscript represents a study that extends our knowledge of the further slip after in situ pinning in SCFE. Comments are given below.

2. Major Compulsory Revisions:
One of the significant findings of this manuscript was that the screw insertion medial to intertrochanteric line was an only significant factor for the slip progression. But the results of statistical analysis was just briefly described in the last paragraph of Result section. This reviewer recommends the more detailed description. The authors should present the data of univariate analysis between the groups with and without the further slip and then show the results of multivariate analysis. Both should be appeared in Tables.

3. Major Compulsory Revisions:
The severer slip usually needs more medial (or anterior) point of the screw insertion to stabilize the slipped epiphysis. From this point, this reviewer speculate the more PTA, as one of the deteriorating factors, resulting the more slip progression. Please clarify it.

4. Major Compulsory Revisions
This study mixed the stable and unstable slip with single and double screws, leading to the difficulty of interpretation of the presented results. This reviewer recommends focusing on the case with stable slip and single screw fixation. That makes the point clearer.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
'I declare that I have no competing interests'