Reviewer's report

Title: Lateral insertion is a good prognostic factor after in situ fixation in slipped capital femoral epiphysis

Version: 1 Date: 31 July 2014

Reviewer: Aik Saw

Reviewer's report:

Dear editor,

This is a good study designed to provide information on technical considerations to improve the stability of screw fixation of slipped capital femoral epiphysis. Detailed measurements were accurately obtained for evaluation. I have only one comment on the analysis of the results.

The study was designed to evaluate various technical variables of the treatment and outcome was based on degree of radiological migration. It would be correct to come to the conclusion if the conditions are homogenous (all the femurs are equally stable). I do not think we can assume that the “degree of displacement” is not associated with “inherent stability” of the condition. In the sample population, the posterior tilting angle (PTA) varies from 18 to 75 degrees. I think that many surgeons will tend to use medial entry for more severe cases, and lateral entry for less severe cases. The two groups will not be comparable in terms of inherent stability from the beginning.

I hope the authors can respond to the comment or revise the write up accordingly. Otherwise, I would support this article to be considered for publication. Thank you.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.