Reviewer's report

Title: Effects of Stemmed and Nonstemmed Hip Replacement on Stress Distribution of Proximal Femur and Implant

Version: 1 Date: 26 May 2014

Reviewer: Amer Almohallami

Reviewer's report:

Minor Essential Revisions:

- The author didn't mention the risks of using hip resurfacing replacements. He can cite a lot of studies which show the risks of this kind of prosthesis.
- The author didn't explain why he used the v.Mises stress to indicate which prosthesis is better. Although he could use the strain energy density as an index to compare the effect of different prosthesis on bones, as a lot of scientific papers concluded.
- In describing the model the author didn't speak about the friction coefficient he used, although it is very important to modelling the contact condition.
- Another point in describing the model is that the author didn't mention the density of the bone material he used.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.