Author's response to reviews

Title: Acute Cell Viability and Nitric Oxide Release in Lateral Menisci Following Closed-Joint Knee Injury in a Lapine Model of Post-Traumatic Osteoarthritis

Authors:

Megan L Killian (killianm@wudosis.wustl.edu)
Roger C Haut (haut@msu.edu)
Tammy L Haut Donahue (Tammy.Donahue@ColoState.edu)

Version: 3 Date: 24 June 2014

Author's response to reviews: see over
June 21st, 2014

Please find enclosed the revised manuscript entitled "Acute Cell Viability and Nitric Oxide Release in Lateral Menisci Following Closed-Joint Knee Injury in a Lapine Model of Post-Traumatic Osteoarthritis". An electronic version has been prepared for the journal *BMC Musculoskeletal Disorders*. Each author has been involved in the design of the study, interpretation of the data, and writing of the manuscript. Each of the authors has read and concurs with the content in the final manuscript.

We have addressed each of the reviewers concerns on a point-by-point basis.

Thank you for considering this revised manuscript.

Respectfully,

Tammy L. Haut Donahue, PhD
Professor of Mechanical Engineering
Tammy.Donahue@ColoState.edu
Response to Reviews

Editorial Report:

Name of ethics committee: Please update your ethics statement to include the name of the ethics committee that approved your study.

Response: We have included in the manuscript that the “Institutional Animal Care and Use Committee” approved this study in the methods section. There is no other name by which to address this committee.

Reviewer’s report:

Version:2 Date:19 April 2014
Reviewer:Simo Saarakkala

Authors have done a nice work for revising their manuscript. Especially, Discussion is now very good as it clearly addresses the limitations of the study. Authors have also changed statistical comparisons of cell viability from two-way ANOVA to paired t-test. They also used only descriptive statistics for NO data, which is correct.

MAJOR COMPULSORY REVISIONS:
All the other issues raised in my report have been now nicely taken into account, and otherwise the manuscript can be recommended for publication, but unfortunately I still think that the choice of new statistical test is wrong. Paired t-test is also parametric test (like ANOVA) and cannot be used here as there are limited number of samples and the normal distribution cannot be assumed. Authors should select a non-parametric statistical test: in this case I believe the correct test should be Wilcoxon signed-rank test. Authors may consult a biostatistician to verify this.

Response: We have updated the manuscript to use a Wilcoxon signed-rank test.