Author's response to reviews

Title: Can Magnetic Resonance Imaging Findings Predict the Degree of Knee Joint Laxity in Patients Undergoing Anterior Cruciate Ligament Reconstruction?

Authors:

Moon Jong Chang (moonjongchang@gmail.com)
Chong Bum Chang (ccbknee@gmail.com)
Ja-Young Choi (drchoi01@gmail.com)
Min Soo Je (peteje@naver.com)
Tae Kyun Kim (osktk@snubh.org)

Version: 2 Date: 22 April 2014

Author's response to reviews:

Reviewer's report

Title: Can Magnetic Resonance Imaging Findings Predict the Degree of Knee Joint Laxity After Anterior Cruciate Ligament Injury?

Version: 1 Date: 24 February 2014

Reviewer: Luca Saba

Reviewer's report:

Introduction

OK

Method

1) Add that the fat sat DP wheigted sequence shows oedema more better than the other.

- We added a new figure (the figure 5 in the revised manuscript) to accept the reviewer’s suggestion. As we our MR protocol did not include sagittal FS PD but sagittal FS T2-weighted image, we have to add sagittal FS T2-weighted image rather FS PD image in the revised manuscript. Nevertheless, we believe that fat suppressed T2 and PD images have similar characteristics and abilities in terms of detection of bone marrow edema.

Result

OK

Discussion

2) I believe that MRI has good diagnostic accuracy in the diagnosis of the anterior cruciate rupture and it can be useful especially in detecting static knee instability. If you want, you could add it.

- We appreciate the reviewer for the valuable suggestion. We mentioned that the MRI is accurate in diagnosing structural integrity of ACL in the manuscript. We
also initially thought that MRI was able to predict the degree of knee joint laxity. However, the results of our study only partly supported our hypothesis. Thus, we would like to maintain the previous discussion regarding the value of MRI for prediction of degrees of laxity.

Reference

3) put the point after the parentheses at the end of the text: "[ ]", not " . [ ] "
- We have corrected the errors throughout the manuscript.

Figures and Table
OK

In conclusion:

I believe that, despite are commonly known the limitations of magnetic resonance imaging in the study of the knee instability after anterior cruciate ligament rupture and that magnetic resonance in only an accuracy method especially for lesions detection, the work is well structured and compare the two main methods of evaluation of knee instability (Pivot and Lachman tests) with magnetic resonance in an interesting way.

- We appreciate the reviewer’s kind consideration of our study.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
'I declare that I have no competing interests'

Title: Can Magnetic Resonance Imaging Findings Predict the Degree of Knee Joint Laxity After Anterior Cruciate Ligament Injury?

Version: 1 Date: 2 February 2014

Reviewer: Stefano Lipia

Reviewer’s report:

1. Minor Essential Revisions

All subjects included in the study are patients requiring "ACL RECONSTRUCTION": I think it is more correct not to use the terms "ACL INJURY", too general, in TITLE and in CONCLUSION.

- We have changed the terms in the title and the conclusion as suggested by the reviewer.

The methods are appropriate and well described;

the data are sound;

the discussion and conclusions are well balanced and adequately supported by the data;
the limitations of the work are clearly stated;  
the writing is acceptable.  
- We appreciate the reviewer’s positive comments.  
Level of interest: An article of importance in its field  
Quality of written English: Acceptable  
Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.  
Declaration of competing interests:  
I declare that I have no competing interests.