Reviewer's report

Title: Unexpected angular or rotational deformity after corrective osteotomy

Version: 1 Date: 23 January 2014

Reviewer: Luke Austin

Reviewer's report:

Major Compulsory Revisions

1. Discussion of Codman's Paradox is an excellent introduction and grabs the readers attention. Also, the pictures do a good job explaining this complicated process. However, please expand on what is meant by: "three closed-loop rotations of the long axis:

2. Background paragraph #2. I believe the arthrodesis example would be useful in explaining were the article is going but is somewhat confusing in the way it is written. Please rewrite and discuss reasons for the loss of internal rotation such as affine geometry. This can all be in the second paragraph.

3. Background last paragraph. Need to rewrite purposes and hypothesis. I find the most interesting point made by this article is the loss of IR when the arm is placed in forward flexion and abduction. consider rewriting article with new purpose for instance: we hypothesize that abduction and forward elevation leads to unexpected external rotation in patients undergoing arthrodesis. This would be a very important and clinically significant article.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Not suitable for publication unless extensively edited

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests