Reviewer's report

Title: Radiographic Signs for Detection of Femoroacetabular Impingement and Hip Dysplasia should be carefully used in Patients with Osteoarthritis of the Hip

Version: 3  Date: 24 February 2014

Reviewer: Luca Saba

Reviewer's report:

Introduction
OK

Method
1) your patients are older (average: 60 years old!) and already could have a para-physiological osteoarthritis; it is important an epidemiological study of prearthrotic deformities in old patients?
2) What do you mean by osteoarthritis?

Result
You should have two observer.

Discussion
Congenital Hip dysplasia is an early diagnosis that is now done in patients within three months of life (Femoro-acetabular impingement (CAM or PINCER) often occurs in young patients who have pain): it is true that early evolves towards in arthrosis, but it makes no sense to argue that epidemiological studies on prearthrotic deformities should only be performed in healthy adults with no signs of osteoarthritic changes because:
1 epidemiological studies are done in young patients (asymptomatic in the early diagnosis);
2 osteoarthritis (what you mean for osteoarthritis?) is often a consequence of an arthrosis form; thus now does not make sense to search a prearthrotic deformities in patients with arthrosis.

Conclusion
it not provides no clinical advancement

Reference
OK

Figures and Table
Where are radiographics images??

Level of interest: An article of insufficient interest to warrant publication in a scientific/medical journal
Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
'I declare that I have no competing interests'