Reviewer’s report

Title: The effect of perinatal brachial plexus lesion on upper limb development

Version: 2
Date: 13 December 2013

Reviewer: Hanno Millesi

Reviewer’s report:

The authors studied 44 patients who had been operated upon because of an obstetric brachial plexus lesion in an age between 3 and 12 months at an average age of 6.8 years. The aim of the study was to determine morphologic data and compare them to the values of the contralateral normal extremity. The values were as expected at the involved side smaller as on the normal extremity. The result was expressed as a percentage of the normal side. The first valuable conclusion is the fact, that all patients suffered this retardation of growth. Furthermore it was tried to find out if there were different relations to certain parameter as gender, circumference of arm and fore arm or and length of upper arm regardless from the fact whether the surgery caused a useful or a useless recovery. A statistically significant difference was found for length of fore arm, length of hand and width of hand.

Another difference was found between the above mentioned parameters and the type of surgery,

The difference in length of arm and hand and the difference in width of the hand was larger if a nerve reconstruction was performed as compared to a neurolyse. Here, more information are needed about the severity of the lesion because usually a nerve lesion needing a reconstruction is more severe as one which can be dealt with a neurolysis. The authors should be encouraged to comment on this point (Discretionary revision).

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

No competing interests.