Reviewer's report

Title: Extracorporeal shockwave therapy shows a number of treatment related chondroprotective effect in osteoarthritis of the knee in rats

Version: 2 Date: 15 January 2013

Reviewer: Gerjo van Osch

Reviewer's report:

The manuscript has further improved. The message is interesting. There are a few things that need improvement.

1. Abstract: I think in the third line of the results the authors meant to say that “Group III and IV showed significant decrease of Mankins score and increase of Safranin O stain as compared to group II” and not group I as they state now.

2. Some details on methods need to be added:
   - Method of decalcification for mankin and safr O was that similar to decalcification method used for the immunohistochemical stainings?
   - Method of scoring the safranin O staining, was it done semiquantitatively or with a computer and what does the scores mean?
   - Immunohistochemistry is scored as % of positive cells. For collagen II this is a bit unconventional, although it does seem to work.

3. Table 1-3 and figure 6-8 contain very similar info. The authors need to choose one of them. In case they chose the figures the statistics need to be incorporated in there. I don’t know why fig.6-8 are labeled graph 1-3.

Please add info in the legends about what is presented (median, mean how many samples). And mention what the score means, for example for Mankin that it runs from 0-13 with 0 indicating no changes and 13 maximum damage. Also make sure the reader will know what a Saf O score of for example 18.7 means. For the immunohistochemistry mention that this is about % of positive cells.

This holds true for tables and the graphs. In principle a reader should be able to understand the main message of the paper by looking at the figures and reading the legends.