Reviewer's report

Title: Monocyte depletion increases local proliferation of macrophage subsets after skeletal muscle injury

Version: 2 Date: 4 August 2013

Reviewer: Melissa Kacena

Reviewer's report:

This is a well-written manuscript on a timely topic that will be of interest to many in the field.

There are just a few minor suggestions (minor discretionary revisions).

Figures/figure legends should be able to stand alone. It would help in Figure 2, for example, to just add to the first sentence in bold, "...macrophages in TA muscle...." So that it is clear where the macrophage number was measured.

Similar changes in other figure legends would also be helpful.

There are also several minor typographical errors that should be altered. For example in the last sentence on page 5 it should read "...[16], and that..." (not "an"). Carefully reviewing the text for similar minor errors is advised.

In my version, there are several symbols that have been replaced with a box (primarily in the methods sections), these should be checked and modified appropriately.

On page 11, the first sentence in the Monocyte depletion is associated with proliferation of macrophages in injured muscles section is over stated. It says that monocyte depletion led to a decrease in macrophage number, this is true at day 2 but not at day 4, the wording should be modified to properly reflect the data.

Since the authors used FACS in their study, it is surprising that they did not examine circulating M2 precursors in their models as they reference in their discussion (ref 16). It would be a nice addition to these studies to include this analysis.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests