Reviewer’s report

Title: Hemiarthroplasties in young patients with osteonecrosis or a tumour of the proximal femur; an observational cohort study

Version: 2 Date: 24 July 2012

Reviewer: Anastasios V. Korompilias

Reviewer’s report:

COMMENTS
1. It is not appropriate to include in the same cohort patients with osteonecrosis and patients with tumours (specially when most of them died during the follow up). This is a very heterogenous group of patients. In addition, unipolar and bipolar, and different types of arthroplasty cannot be statistically be analysed. This definitively leads to conflicting results.

2. Most of the material and methods are demonstrated in the “Results” section and the “Patients and Methods “ section is surprisingly the last part of the manuscript.

3. There was an effort for a very detailed statistical analysis, however the small number of patients divided in a lot of group of analysis does not allow for conclusions.

4. My personal opinion is that, the authors should focus their efforts in one group of patients (osteonecrosis OR tumour) because is more easier for observation and analysis, otherwise is only a statistical “puzzle” trying to explain the results and the data

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests