Reviewer’s report

Title: Evaluation of etoricoxib in patients undergoing total knee replacement surgery in a double-blind, randomized controlled trial

Version: 1 Date: 28 December 2012

Reviewer: Morteza Meftah

Reviewer’s report:

This is an interesting, well conducted RCT that shows safety and efficacy of etoricoxib, that it reduces post-op morphine requirement and it is at least as effective as ibuprofen. It would have been interesting if they could compare the efficacy of etoricoxib and morphine instead of ibuprofen, since rarely ibuprofen is used on a regular bases after total knee replacement. It is worth publishing with following considerations.

Background:
I would add that the indications for total knee replacement are expanding in younger and more active patients with various intra-articular pathologies. The aims of the study should be numbered.

Methods:
Very long, should be more condense and to the point if possible. In “patients” section, why morbidly obese pts were excluded? Basically all pts with ASA class III/IV were excluded?

Surgical procedure: The use of tourniquet is a potential confounder of the post-op complications and it should be included.

Please provide a reference for the Recovery Index.

What degree of knee flexion? Active or passive? In the immediate post-op period, extreme knee flexion obviously causes more pain.

The first paragraph of discussion should focus on details of etoricoxib then describe the goals of the study.

Page 24, second paragraph: “Etoricoxib 90 mg was evaluated using the third-molar extraction dental pain model and in patients who underwent total abdominal hysterectomy surgery [19,20]” is confusion, please clarify and separate the references.

Page 26, second paragraph: cardiovascular complications, DVT, PE are also dependent on patients’ factors, tourniquet time (if used), surgical time, technique (cementation, intramedullary instrumentation), and modes of post-op DVT prophylaxis.
Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests