Reviewer’s report

Title: Prevalence of mediopatellar plica in subjects with knee pain and the association with patellofemoral cartilage damage and bone marrow lesions: Data from the Joints on Glucosamine Study

Version: 1 Date: 12 May 2013

Reviewer: Shaw-Ruey Lyu

Reviewer’s report:

This study seems irrefutably well conducted and the manuscript well written. However, the crucial defect of this study is the lack of arthroscopic confirmation of their radiographic findings. Therefore, the results (Line 217-219; 224-226) and discussion (Line 231-233; 272-274), and abstract (Line 45) concerning the cartilage lesion on the medial femoral condyle were quite incompatible with arthroscopic surgeons’ point of view (ref. 6, 7, 24) and could be misleading. The discrepancy between the findings of this study and other arthroscopic surgeons’ findings might either disproved surgeons’ eyes or invalidate MRI’s diagnostic sensitivity regarding cartilagenous lesions in this focus region (anterior femoral condyle). Since it’s a common understanding that any clinical diagnosis could not be counted only on the radiographic evaluation, I am afraid that the results of this manuscript could be misleading and might not have enough clinical value to be published.

Level of interest: An article of insufficient interest to warrant publication in a scientific/medical journal

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.