Reviewer’s report

Title: The course of radiographic loosening, pain and functional outcome around the first revision of a total hip arthroplasty

Version: 1 Date: 12 February 2013

Reviewer: Naomi Kobayashi

Reviewer’s report:

The authors investigated the course and interrelationships of radiographic loosening, pain and physical function 5 year before and after a first revision THA.

The serious issue of this study is that this is retrospective study. Because each clinical data must be collected from previous database, so that it seems difficult to assess accurate clinical outcome or functional status.

It is also important to understand that revision surgery include many kinds of parameters such as cause of loosening, technical issue, implant selection etc. It is difficult to find any specific value in this study. All results seems quite common from point of clinician. However, it may be suggestive for us that most strong motivation for revision surgery should be pain relief, rather than functional outcome.

It seems better to omit radiographic result, because radiographic loosening is irrelevant in this study. I suggest that the author should describe only about clinical results, if possible including some activity score or muscle power data, rather than radiographic loosening.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.