Reviewer’s report

Title: The course of radiographic loosening, pain and functional outcome around the first revision of a total hip arthroplasty

Version: 1 Date: 9 February 2013

Reviewer: Sofia Chatziioannou

Reviewer’s report:

This is a well written retrospective study that evaluates the patients in the time period around the first revision after total hip arthroplasty. The study derives the information from a large database, which makes its results interesting and, although relatively known in the day to day practice, not easily reproducible by an another study. A drawback is that because of the nature of the study itself, the patients’ sample was not homogeneous, the physicians that performed the operation were apparently multiple and the procedure/type of implant used varied significantly between patients. This weakness is already mentioned in the discussion section, and it is understood that in studies based on databases, it cannot be easily overcome. Therefore, in general the information derived from the present study is useful and clinically relevant.

Minor Essential Revision

1. Figure 1 and table 2 show exactly the same information. Please remove the one of the two.

2. 80.1% of the patients had pain at the time of the revision. Please comment on why almost 20% of the patients did not have pain, but still underwent revision. Based on the results of the study would the authors still recommend surgery on these patients? Please comment on that.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.