Author's response to reviews

Title: Type 3 finger length pattern is associated with total knee replacements due to osteoarthritis but not with hip replacements or hand osteoarthritis in the elderly: The AGES-Reykjavik Study.

Authors:

Kristin Sigurjonsdottir (krs2@hi.is)
Thorir M Bjorgulfsson (thb1@hi.is)
Thor Aspelund (aspelund@hjarta.is)
Gudny Eiriksdottir (gudny@hjarta.is)
Sigurdur Sigurdsson (sigurdur@hjarta.is)
Tamara B Harris (harrista@nia.nih.gov)
Lenore Launer (launerl@nia.nih.gov)
Vilmundur Gudnason (v.gudnason@hjarta.is)
Helgi Jonsson (helgijon@landspitali.is)

Version: 4 Date: 8 March 2013

Author's response to reviews: see over
Reykjavik, March 8, 2013.

To the editor BMC Musculoskeletal Disorders.

Dear Sir,

We are impressed and grateful for the thorough reviewing of reviewer 2. We have now edited the manuscript accordingly. We hope that you will now find the paper suitable for publication.

Reviewer 2:

Major Compulsory Revisions:

1. The determination of finger length pattern reading is now further clarified in the Methods.
2. The statistics software is now given.
3. We feel that the tables give a visual overview of the data as they stand. Involving p values would complicate this view because age, gender and BMI as well as bone mineral density would have to be accounted for. Instead, odds-ratios and p-values from binary regression analysis (including non-significant results) is now given in the text for all groups.
4. See answer to 3.
5. We are well aware of the possible relations between hip shape and hip OA. So much in fact that we are doing 3D readings from CT scans of all hips in the AGES-Reykjavik Study. However we still think that since we did not find an association between hip OA and finger length ratio (and neither did others see references 15 and 16), such discussion is outside the scope of this paper.
6. We are aware of the possibilities of misclassification and this is now mentioned in the discussion.

The minor essential revisions have also been corrected.

Yours sincerely,

Kristin Sigurjonsdottir