Reviewer's report

Title: The Effects of Knee Arthroplasty on Walking Speed: A Meta-analysis

Version: 1 Date: 13 October 2011

Reviewer: Nahum Rosenberg

Reviewer's report:

The following are the major concerns regarding this paper:

• Pulling the outcome data following TKA and UKA might be misleading because these surgical procedures have different indications, treat different intrarticular pathologies, in patients in different age groups and have different postsurgical rehabilitation expectations.

• The results presented do not provide any new information, i.e. it is well known that the expected initial rehab period is six months, therefore the evidence of high variability of outcome in this period is meaningless, additionally it is expected that following the initial rehab period, after 5-6- month, drastic improvement of pain is expected and if the knee pain was the only limiting preop factor the improvement in walking speed is expected. Existence of other limiting factors and their impact are not provided or discussed.

• The evolution of the restriction of the distance of walking ability is not provided, although this factor might be of greater importance than the speed of walking, as the reflection of functional outcome following knee arthroplasty. This point has been discussed previously in several reports.

This meta analysis does not provide a substantial new information therefore it is not suitable for the publication.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

'I declare that I have no competing interests'