Reviewer's report

Title: Metal ion levels in large-diameter total hip and resurfacing hip arthroplasty - Preliminary results of a prospective five year study after two years of follow-up

Version: 2 Date: 17 December 2011

Reviewer: Jendrik Hardes

Reviewer's report:

Discretionary Revisions

This prospective study determines serum metal ion levels in patients treated with large-diameter metal-on-metal THA or hip resurfacing. The introduction is too long and focuses too intensively to toxicological side effects. This is not the topic of this study. The methodology of this study is good; the number of patients is small. However, I agree with the authors that preliminary results of this manufacturer are urgently needed because of the recall of this system. However, the author should precise, in which patients THA and in which hip resurfacing was indicated.

Overall, the methodology of this study is good and the authors discuss their results very intensively. Due to the current recall of this prosthesis system even smaller studies with a short follow-up are reasonable. Furthermore, the authors give an extensive overview about the limitations of the study.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.