Reviewer's report

Title: Sagittal plane gait characteristics in subjects with hip osteoarthritis with mild to moderate symptoms compared to healthy controls: A cross-sectional study

Version: 2 Date: 30 October 2012

Reviewer: Yong-Hao Pua

Reviewer's report:

The authors are responsive to my critiques and their efforts to revise the manuscript are apparent. I do, however, have a few remaining concerns, and they are detailed below.

- Major Compulsory Revisions

Background

I am generally satisfied with the authors’ justification to analyze MJS as a dichotomized variable. Nevertheless, however sound the justification, the problem of reduced statistical power remains. In fact, an indication of this problem may be seen from the authors’ conclusion that both groups did not differ statistically on the hip ROM measures (page 17). Inspecting Table 3, however, it is evident that clinical, but not statistical, differences in hip flexion and internal rotation ROM could be observed between the 2 groups. Specifically, the between-group differences in hip flexion ROM was 9 degrees; in internal rotation ROM, 7 degrees. In my judgment, these differences have either paralleled or exceeded their minimum detectable change scores. Can the authors acknowledge the possibility of low statistical power or explain their null findings in their revised paper?

Results

I am satisfied with the authors’ responses. In the Table footers, however, the authors seem to vacillate between “Nm/BW” and “Nm/BW*100”. I prefer the latter. Please be consistent with the notations.

- Minor Essential Revisions

Tables

Several 95% CIs included 0 but the attendant P-values were <0.05. I believe – and hope – that these are transcription errors. Please fix them.

Grammatical and typo errors

o pg4: “had focus” should read “focused”

The authors still have not changed them. Please do so this time round.

o Pg6: “53 first patients” should read “first 53 patients”
Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests