Reviewer’s report

Title: Hip resurfacing in a district general hospital: 6-year clinical results using the ReCap hip resurfacing system

Version: 1 Date: 8 March 2012

Reviewer: Thomas Gross

Reviewer’s report:

Minor Essential:
add number of patients that have reached each f/u interval on fig3.

Comments:

The Biomet Magnum cup is only hemispherical indesign for the outer diameter. The critical inner bearing surface has a coverage arc ranging from 155 -164 degrees from smallest to largest component similar to BHR, Conserve, and Cormet designs. (Therefore we would expect a similar adverse wear failure rate for the Biomet as other similar bearing designs. The ASR had a much lower coverage arc, one of the reasons for its high failure rate.)

ALVAL is a histologic diagnosis, not an operative finding.

Tables were not provided for review

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

Conflict:
I was the design surgeon of the Biomet recap/magnum. Royalties ended 12/2010